

BEST PRACTICES IN E-GOVERNANCE IMPLEMENTATION

Vandana Poojari, Debadarshini Nayak, Prakash M

Department of Commerce, Christ (Deemed to be University)

Abstract-The purpose of this research article is to identify the best practices of e-governance in use in various countries. This article follows a qualitative research approach. The findings from this research intend to help countries to incorporate best practices from high EGDI ranking countries in their e-governance model. In this paper, we have reviewed secondary data collected from various research articles, government websites and the United Nations E-Governance Survey Report of 2020. For our paper, we have only selected best e-governance practices from high-ranking countries and those that have won awards for their service provision. We have not considered countries that were relatively lower ranked. This can form the basis for further research.

Keywords- e-Governance, Digital Governance, Information and Communication Technology, Artificial Intelligence, Online Services.

I. INTRODUCTION

E-Governance has taken a turn for the positive in the recent years. Public participation and provision of people-centric services have taken a front seat. Countries have begun to understand the

growing importance of e-governance and how it is an important means of public administration. The United Nations E-Government Survey 2020 reports that a record number of countries and municipalities are taking initiatives towards a digital government transformation. These countries have specifically taken measures to deliver e-government as a platform, to integrate online and offline service delivery channels, to expand digital services, and to expand public participation and partnerships. E-government development is on a steady rise, with the global average E-Government Development Index (EGDI) value increasing from 0.55 in 2018 to 0.60 in 2020 (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020). Despite the fact, that there is a positive correlation between the EGDI ranking and the income of a country, many countries with low income and poor IT infrastructure have been able to achieve high levels of e-governance and development. The number of countries with middle income levels that were able to achieve high levels of e-governance increased by 57% and lower-middle countries advanced by more than 15% in 2020 (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020). Countries like India and Uzbekistan have made considerable progress in online service delivery in spite of moderate infrastructure

development. It is quite evident that it is not just the income levels and telecommunications infrastructure that determine the success of e-governance. A strong political will, leadership and commitment can achieve a high EGDI rating. For example, Bangladesh was able to achieve a high EGDI rating in spite of being a lower-middle income country. This feat can be attributed to it strengthening the online connectivity of the public sector and making considerable investments in the digital literacy of its employees. Bangladesh also integrated 46000 virtual government offices in an attempt to provide a one-stop shop service. Many developing countries, including India, can learn from the initiatives taken by Bangladesh. Therefore, the authors of this paper attempt to identify the best practices of e-governance implemented among the top performers of the EGDI ratings.

II. REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Information and communication technology has made tremendous progress over the past few decades. ICT has had quite the 'Midas Touch' effect- turning everything it touches into gold. E-governance is a shining example of the way ICT has changed things for the better. E-governance has transformed the relationship between citizens and public administrators by eliminating long queues, tedious forms, face to face interactions and unprecedented delays (Daniela, 2012). However, e-governance is not just about revamping the demand side of the equation. It first started off with the

integration and automation of the internal working of the government (Barthwal, 2003; Westholm, 2005). Business process re-engineering or BPR grew to prominence in the late 1980's to mid-1990. The whole idea behind BPR was that technology could be used to de-layer organisations, eliminate unnecessary processes and rely on core processes only. This simplified the functioning of organisations, cut down costs and most importantly technology enabled organisations to process huge volumes of information (Bannister and Connolly, 2012).

It wasn't long before public administration systems started following suit. Governments are these gigantic bureaucratic systems that make access to information and provision of services a difficult task (Kumar et al, 2007). BPR enabled Governments to possess infrastructure that could integrate several non-integrated subsystems through centralisation of back-offices, de-centralisation of front offices or with the help of a clearing house (Westholm, 2005). However, this doesn't necessarily translate to a change in the structure, processes or the norms of government. In other words, can ICT enabled governance achieve something that would have otherwise not been possible? Banister and Connolly argue that in many cases the essence of governance remains the same. If the same numbers of documents are required electronically, no new services are offered and there is no alteration of processes involved then what we

have is a government that operates electronically. Such a system cannot be termed e-governance.

This is how the concept of e-governance as a means of promoting good governance evolved. Many authors acknowledge that accountability, transparency and participation are the essential dimensions of good governance (Heeks, 2006; Bannister and Connolly, 2012; Garg, 2008; Barthwal, 2003). Mander and Asif say that the idea behind good governance is to enhance delivery of service to make it more accountable, transparent, accessible, effective and efficient. The concept of good governance has gained so much importance over the years that even the United Nations Summit held in New York in September 2015 included good governance in its 2030 Agenda. Bangladesh's digital financial inclusion initiatives are an excellent example of good governance. The rural poor in Bangladesh find the formal financial system difficult to access. Since building a physical network of banks would have been too difficult to accomplish, the Government launched The Digital Financial Services (DFS) Lab. The Digital Financial System has been able to provide agent banking and mobile financial services across 1900 digital centres in Bangladesh with research suggesting that the country could make significant savings in time, cost and number of visits (United Nations E-Government Survey 2018, 2018).

The development or progression of e-governance happens in four stages or phases. These

stages may differ in different papers or go by different names, but most authors agree that development of e-governance happens in these four stages: 1) Information 2) Interaction 3) Transaction/Integration and 4) e-Democracy (Van der Meer, Gelders & Rotthier, 2014; Westholm, 2005; Yadav, 2009; Barthwal, 2003; Jho & Song, 2007; Rose, 2005). Even The e-Government Municipal Assessment Project that assesses the services performed by the local administrations in the US group their performance across four dimensions: information dissemination, interactive functions, e-commerce functions and e-democracy (United Nations E-Government Survey 2018, 2018). Most countries today have achieved information dissemination and have multiple websites dedicated to this cause. Such information can include government policies, provisions of important laws, information about electoral candidates etc. Such information in turn encourages citizen interaction and facilitates e-policy proposals or surveys that allow citizens to give their opinions (Jho & Song, 2007). High income and most low and middle income countries that possess the required infrastructure and technology have been successful in achieving interaction and transaction services too (United Nations E-Government Survey 2018, 2018). However, very few countries have achieved e-democracy. Most governments occasionally try to engage in e-participation practices beyond the transactional stage (Van der Meer, Gelders & Rotthier, 2014). Participatory budgets are a popular

means of promoting citizen participation. PB platforms enable citizens to monitor and weigh in on public spending, fiscal policy, understand allocation of resources and even act as a medium of advancing proposals among many other uses. Seattle's "Your Voice, Your Choice: Parks & Streets" allowed residents to vote on how a portion of the city's budget should be spent on park and street developments (Baxter, 2017). Japan's e-government uses opinion collecting system within the e-government portal to allow citizens to give their feedback on government policies (Jho and Song, 2007).

Despite the diverse opportunities and merits of e-governance, it suffers from criticism. Privacy is the biggest concern for citizens. E-Governance services deal with huge volumes of confidential information about its users and concerns about the safe keeping and usage of such information is very critical. Effective leadership is another major challenge. Those tasked with implementing e-governance have no motivation to do so and view e-governance as another cumbersome procedure imposed on them with an already full workload (Kolsaker and Kelley, 2008) (25). It has also been observed that the benefits of e-governance are only enjoyed by the affluent sections (Yadav, 2009). Digital divide has made it difficult for e-governance initiatives to succeed, especially in lower income countries. Other drawbacks are corruption, expensive IT infrastructure, lack of legal reforms,

conflict between state and federal governments, limited to information dissemination and lack of trust in the Government.

In China, in spite of a decade of discussion of felony reforms and the rule of law, the prison regime is still in large part controlled by way of the political imperatives of the Chinese Communist Party and also lacks an advanced system of records and control (Kluver, 2005). Where as in India, the primary difficulty in implementing the Digital India Mission is the huge digital divide that exists inside the country. (Waisanen, 2002). This can be attributed to poor education and low degree of IT skills awareness among people. Despite the fact, that cell penetration in India is high, internet connection and broadband connectivity are one of the lowest within the world (Warf, 2014). India faces the problems of low connectivity, inexperienced technical professionals, high price range, haphazard planning, and lack of a clear blue print for enforcing numerous e-governance initiatives (Heeks, 2005). Most ICT programs are carried out in a brief time frame with no change in the organizational structure and operational procedures (Dhal, 2020). There are technical troubles in imposing e-governance transformation. Information and Communication Technology infrastructure is the main requisite for electronic governance transformation. Governments have to construct a powerful telecommunication infrastructure (Chatterji, 2018).

Privacy and security of confidential reports is another major problem. Issues concerning hacking of defence records and other statistics, tracking through websites, mismanagement of private statistics can pose huge challenges (MELITSKI, 2007). E-infrastructure should be protected with the use of firewalls and records accessibility needs to be limited (Prasad, 2012). Security technology like encryption and virtual signatures should be put in place to guard user IDs, credit score card numbers, passwords, and other vulnerable data (Malik, 2015).

Another barrier to successful implementation of e-governance models in most countries are websites that are complex and difficult to navigate. In order to develop consumer centric portals, authorities' workplaces should be able to offer their services that are easily reachable from a webpage. A consumer centric portal should provide information, communications and transactions. It should comprise of public facts that are easily accessible to anyone interested. They must also disclose private records concerning the status of all client commercial projects being developed (Roy, 2003). A consumer centric portal should also be able to provide internet communications via different channels: text, voice and video. Development of voice and video communications is particularly essential to less educated sections of the society because a text without oral explanation could be too hard for them to understand. Finally, a

customer centric portal ought to facilitate digital transactions and provide for payments to be executed electronically (Mohammad, 2009).

III. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The paper follows a qualitative review method. Data was collected from various research articles, government websites and reports including The United Nations E-Governance Survey. The authors of the paper have attempted to identify the best e-governance practices in use. These practices were either selected from countries that performed well in the EGDI rankings or have won awards for innovative and one of a kind service provision. All of the practices selected feature in The United Nations E-Governance Survey of 2020.

IV. BEST PRACTICES

A. E-Participation

1) *Madrid: Decide Madrid*: This was launched as the first e-participation platform of Madrid in the year 2015. Decide Madrid allowed the participation of various players in the city of Madrid namely the municipalities, citizens, companies, associations and NGOs. It received the award for United Nations Public Service in 2018 (Royo, 2020). This e-participation platform encourages citizens participating in the management of the city. Citizens can take part in various ideation processes and even introduce policies and propositions to improve the city. Decide Madrid also provides

counselling before making their pick between elective undertakings and also encourages them to take part in participatory planning. There are various stages in a policy making cycle such as agenda setting, policy analysis and preparation, formulation of the policy which citizens can choose from to take part in. A software called “CONSUL” has been deployed in various institutions to enable e-participation (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

2) *Participatory Budgeting in the Republic of Korea:* In order to enhance the democratic values of participation, it is important to involve more people in the decision-making processes of the government. Decision making will be more realistic if there is people participation and will enhance government’s capability of problem solving. Korea has implemented participatory planning at various local and neighbourhood levels for the past 30 years. The citizens of Korea have a say in how the nation’s monetary policies are drafted and where its funds are utilised by way of spending propositions and allowing individuals to take part in the spending planning. The Republic of Korea also allows frequent interactions on its Government website (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

3) *Bogota: Virtual Tools to Submit Complaints:* Bogota te escucha is a framework intended to oversee petitions—a virtual apparatus individuals can use to submit grumblings, claims,

demands for data, requests, ideas, worries about potential demonstrations of defilement, or straightforward solicitations. The framework offers an enlistment administration and in addition permits individuals to record mysterious solicitations and to check the situation with their entries. The solicitations can be submitted face to face or recorded as a hard copy, by email or by phone, through the web or normal mail, or can be handed through informal organization (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

B. Use of Artificial Intelligence and Technology

It goes without saying that we have taken great strides in technology over the past few decades. E-governance has been a product of that advancement. Even though e-governance was all about revamping and automating the public sector (Bannister and Connolly, 2012), it did transform into a platform for service provision. (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

1) *Boston: School Bus Routing Optimisation:* In the US, over 50% of school children rely on school buses to transport to and from school. Boston spends 10% of the district’s \$1 billion budget on transportation on account of its specialised programs drawing students from all over the city and traffic at peak hours (Bertsimas, Delarue & Martin, 2018). Boston Public Schools, in an effort to optimise school bus routes and transportation cost, held a competition where a team from MIT

Operations Research Centre came out with a winning algorithm called BiRD (Biobjective Routing Decomposition). BiRD solved the school bus routing problem by creating an algorithm that helped assign children to stops nearest their homes and selecting the bus and the order in which each student would be picked up in order to reduce the number of buses being operated. On implementing BiRD, Boston Public Schools were able to eliminate 50 school buses and save approximately \$10-15 million on transportation i.e., an 18% reduction in cost. (Bertsimas, Delarue & Martin, 2018; The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020). Before the introduction of BiRD, Boston Public Schools manually computed bus routes for 125 public schools and 80 private and charter schools. Post-implementation of the algorithm, Boston was able to bring down the computation of school bus routes to just 30 minutes.

2) *Sao Paulo: Effective Waste Management:* Waste management is a huge problem in most countries with more than 2 billion tons of waste generated around the world every year. It is a significant problem in developing nations. Brazil alone accounts for 41.3% of the waste that is improperly disposed of, leading to adverse effects on the environment and public health (Sousa, 2019). In view of this rising problem, Brazil has passed a law that makes it mandatory for every company in Sao Paulo to declare the waste that they generate and how they manage, treat and dispose of it. The

Electronic Waste Transport Council (CTR-E) is Sao Paulo's technology-based garbage collection and management system that requires the city's companies to declare the waste that they generate over an electronic form (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020). The CTR-E tracks and gathers information about the volume, source and destination of the waste generated with the help of smartphone apps and QR codes on garbage trucks, containers and dumpsters. This allows municipal authorities to come up with waste treatment solutions through recycling and reuse (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020; Sousa, 2019).

3) *Hangzhou: Realtime Traffic Management:* Hangzhou is one of the first cities in the world to manage its traffic and public affairs with AI technology assistance (Yifei, 2017). It uses an Alibaba invention called the City Brain which is able to collect information from across the city by way of video cameras at intersections and GPS data from cars and buses (Toh and Erasmus, 2019). The city makes use of big data analytics to analyse real-time data in order to reduce congestion, crime and road accidents (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020). Analysis of such real-time data allows authorities to identify and quickly respond to accidents and manage traffic accordingly. The system reported 92% of accidents accurately, improving traffic efficiency (Yifei, 2017). Hangzhou, which was once ranked 5th among China's most congested cities, after two years of

testing and implementing City Brain, dropped to 57th on the list. Real-time traffic management has even reduced the response time of ambulances and fire trucks considerably. The use of AI and video recognition algorithms have increased traffic speeds by 11% and reduced travel time by 10% in the city (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

4) *Buenos Aires: Cloud-Based Lighting:* Buenos Aires was faced with the challenge of an increasing population and the need for sustainable energy consumption while also reducing CO₂ emissions. The city implemented a high-quality LED lighting system with cloud-based management in order to achieve sustainable use and lower costs with maximum efficiency ("Buenos Aires | Interact", n.d.). The lighting system allows the city to monitor, dim and turn each of the light points on or off while creating adequate conditions for pedestrians and vehicles (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020). The system also enables performance monitoring, energy consumption, and detection of faults. Over the course of three years, Buenos Aires was able to install 91000 new light points and was able to upgrade 75% of the lighting in the city. This led to a savings of 50% in operational costs and significantly reducing the city's CO₂ emissions ("Buenos Aires | Interact", n.d.).

5) *Dubai: Rammas Chatbot:* The Dubai Electricity and Water Authority (DEWA) launched Rammas Chatbot, for direct and real-time interaction with

customers. It uses AI to provide services to DEWA's customers, suppliers, contractors, consultants, government organisations as well as job seekers (Sutton, 2019). The system has been integrated with utility's SAP system to enable transactions such as bill enquiry and payment, tracking of application status, job enquiries and applications, and new connections requests with contractors and suppliers (Sutton, 2019). Rammas is able to respond to enquiries instantly based on an analysis of the available data and its ability to streamline different transactions. The Rammas Chatbot was launched with the intention of reducing the number of visitors to DEWA by 80% and as a means to supporting the Smart Dubai initiative (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020). It even won a 'BIG Innovation Award' for its innovative idea.

C. Attention to Vulnerable Population

The idea of e-governance or e-government is to provide services and to be able to reach the maximum number of citizens in a country. However, a large part of the population still remains cut off from this platform due to factors like inadequate infrastructure, the digital divide, and even lack of technical know-how. In Kenya, the one-stop-shop e-governance model remains more of an urban experience. The platform is barely able to reach the larger population that lives in the rural setting (Onyango, 2017). Nations have now begun to realise how e-governance can be used to direct

efforts and resources to the vulnerable population. The United Nations E-Government Survey of 2020 reports that there has been a positive trend towards the inclusion of provision of services to vulnerable populations. Since 2018, the number of countries providing online information and services specifically targeted at vulnerable populations has increased by 11 percent. These services are offered to young people (156 countries), women (151 countries), migrants (148 countries), older persons (148 countries), persons with disabilities (137 countries), and people living in poverty (130 countries) (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

1) New York City: ASL Direct: In 2018, New York became the first city in the US to offer information and services to the deaf and hard of hearing. The ASL Direct is built for the deaf and hard of hearing and who primarily communicate via American Sign Language. The platform enables its users to connect over video technology with information specialists that are fluent in ASL (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020). The ASL Direct can be accessed online or through a mobile app. It provides a one-stop-shop service where its users may avail information and services relating to employment, housing, city accessibility, accessible transportation, managing emergencies, and other areas. With this initiative, New York aims to ensure equal access inclusivity to all its citizens.

2) China: Online Services for Persons with Disabilities: China's e-governance model is reaching out to persons with disabilities by providing innovative online applications that can be made directly on the national e-governance portal. One such special application enables applicants to apply for assistive devices from the government. China has made efforts to make this process easy and convenient for persons with disabilities so they may not have to fill in too many forms or submit documents. Instead, assistive devices service is given to all those citizens that hold a Beijing household registration, negating the need to submit additional certification. The government also provides a 50% subsidy for devices purchased on the platform, with a 100% percent subsidy to those who have a low income, receive a subsistence allowance, are below the age of 16, and are students above the age of 16. Such online services aimed at vulnerable populations can eliminate all certifications and intermediate steps to enable vulnerable persons to conduct all such transactions from home (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

3) Singapore: Silver Infocomm Initiative: A lot of e-governance portals and platforms around the world focus on providing equitable services to its vulnerable populations. Singapore's Silver Infocomm Initiative is a set of programs that targets the older residents and equips them with the necessary digital skills that they can apply in the

real world. The curriculum consists of four important components: awareness, skills, access points, and usage. The iBEGIN module helps participants learn beginner levelskills such as operating a computer, sending emails, making video calls, sending messages, etc. The iLIVE module takes the learning one step further, with learning how to make online transactions, booking online tickets, and using the e-government portal and various other online platforms. All of the modules are senior-friendly and are available in both English and Chinese. Participants can either enrol for virtual classes or attend classes in person. For those participants that have mastered the curriculum and would like to make use of their skills in the real world, the Silver Infocomm Initiative also offers five advanced courses in digital photography, movie making, coding, art and music, and book authoring (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

4) *Madrid: Decide Madrid:* Digital divide is one of the key barriers to the implementation of a successful e-governance model. Madrid set up a virtual participation platform called Decide Madrid in 2015 to overcome the challenge of the digital divide. In 2018, Decide Madrid won a United Nations Service Award for being an innovative and inclusive platform. The online platform is supported by other channels that allow all sections of the population to have a say in decision-making, especially the ones affected by the digital divide.

Multiple municipal agencies collaborate under this platform, including 26 service offices, the telephone service, and various local forums. The Inclusion, Neutrality, and Privacy Service of the City Council of Madrid was established at the local levels to encourage citizen participation and enable all voices to be heard. The office also works with various social organisations and associations that cater to specific groups in order to understand the barriers to participation and determining solutions to overcome such barriers (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

D. One-Stop Shop E-Government

Advancements in technology have changed the way citizens interact with their government and vice-versa. Technology has enabled governments to integrate their various websites and create a one-stop platform for e-governance service delivery. It provides a single point of access to online services and information that different public authorities have to offer (Scholta et al, 2020). The one-stop shop e-governance model is gaining prominence with a growing number of countries providing a one-stop shop platform through customer-centric websites as single points of access where people and companies can access information and data, request services and documents, perform transactions, perform legal obligations and even take part in e-citizen participation governance programs (The United Nations E-governance Survey, 2020).

- 1) *The Republic of Korea:* Since 2001, the Korean government has set up 11 activities and 31 guides to fabricate e-Government framework. This foundation has been effective and very much regarded in the worldwide society, a few upgrades were needed towards an all-inclusive resource arrangement (Shkarlet, 2020). The framework utilized by the Korean government was a one-stop arrangement with a solitary point for the resident to get to taxpayer supported organizations. A Virtual Employment – Welfare Plus Centre (VEWPC) is then acquainted with bind together the administrations offered to the resident. Contrasting this views and UK's e-Government arrangement and survey of relating writing, a few necessities for change towards an all-inclusive resource arrangement execution have been distinguished. A refined engineering to execute a South Korean e-Government all-inclusive resource is distinguished (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).
- 2) *Singapore:* It was a necessity to consolidate all previously delivered citizen services which was provided by different government agencies into a single platform for citizen's benefit. The government technology of Singapore was given the responsibility to convert it into one stop shop e-government which later helped citizens to access relevant services during various points of their lives (Weiling ke, 2004). The first initiative was forming a smartphone app which can enable users to register which later helped citizen at the time of availing services of government (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).
- 3) *Japan:* The requirement of coordination between various systems was needed as Japan was aiming for systemization of their government services provided to citizens. Advancement in technology innovations helped Japan to achieve one stop shop e-government where citizens can use and access government services easily (Shafi, 2012). The aim was to provide services 24/7/365 by boosting transparency, effectiveness, and simplify process to citizens while providing them with government services. IT innovations were made in such way that it systemized multiple systems to single system for making government system easier and more accessible (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).
- 4) *Australia & New Zealand:* Customers tend to compare services provided by private sector with services provided by the government. Australia tried shifting to one stop shop approach with help of digitization for improving and fulfilling customer's needs. Australia adopted NPM (Net public management) concept where it aimed in improving the accountability of public sector, reducing the size of government making public sector more competitive and responsive to its citizens. NPM adopted the concept of total quality management to ensure quality services which was basically used first in Japan by a private manufacturing sector. Australia looked at the differences in online service

which were provide by private sector with public sector in initial e-government (Lee, 2005). New Zealand aimed to go online in terms of providing online services by making citizens collect, use information anywhere at any time during any specific period (The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020).

V. CONCLUSION

The term electronic governance conveys how technology has completely revamped public administration and governance. Even though e-governance or e-government was introduced with the intention of lessening the burden on government employees and make their jobs easier, focus has shifted to the demand side of the equation i.e., the citizens of a country. The various stages of e-government evolution all focus on making the entire process citizen-centric, right from information dissemination to the one-stop shop government. It is clear from the review of literature and the identification of best practices in e-governance implementation that countries that dedicate their portals to serving all the various needs of their citizens are the ones that are successfully able to implement e-governance and have also achieved higher EGDI rankings.

Countries that have incorporated a single access point to all e-governance needs have eliminated the need to fill numerous forms, complete tedious legal formalities and have face to

face interactions with government officers. This has simplified the entire process allowing customers to request and complete services at the click of a button. Use of technology like artificial intelligence, block chain and, big data analytics have reduced a lot of redundant work and made the entire process a lot faster and efficient. E-participation and attention to vulnerable populations have made e-governance inclusive and customer-oriented. It is evident from all of the best practices listed above, that the focus of e-governance has been the empowerment of its citizens. Countries that have focused on such measures have fared well on the EGDI rankings and built a successful e-governance model. Most developing countries like India are yet to achieve a one-stop shop e-government and are very far behind in e-participative practices. We may have made considerable progress in technology but not enough to incorporate the best practices identified in this paper. Countries that are lower rated can certainly advance their e-government models by learning from the best e-governance practices. However, for the purpose of our study we have only focused on high-ranking countries on the EGDI list. Further researches can focus on identifying best practices in countries that rank further down the list.

REFERENCES

- Ailsa Kolsaker, L. L.-K. (2008). Citizens' attitudes towards e-government and e-governance: A UK Study.
- ALONSO, A. I. (2009). E-Participation and Local Governance: A Case Study. *Theoretical and Empirical Researches in Urban Management*.
- Anil Kumar Vaddiraju, S. M. (2019). E-governance: Learning from Karnataka. *Indian Journal of Public Administration*.
- Anne Fleur van Veenstra, B. K. (2011). Barriers and Impediments to Transformational Government: Insights from Literature and Practice. *Electronic Government, An International Journal*.
- Apeksha Hooda Nandal, M. S. (2018). Investigating the impact of metaphors on citizens' adoption of e-governance in developing countries: An empirical study.
- Barthwal, C. (2003). E-Governance for Good Governance. *The Indian Journal of Political Science*.
- Baxter, D. J. (2017). e-Governance and e-Participation via Online Citizen Budgets and Electronic Lobbying. *World Affairs*.
- C Griffiths, M. G. (2008). Are one-stop shops acceptable? Community perspectives on one-stop shop models of sexual health service provision in the UK C.
- Daniela, M. (2012). Developing E-Government for Better Public Services within European Union. *Theoretical and Empirical Researches in Urban Management*.
- DARPAN ANAND, V. K. (2019). Unified and integrated authentication and key agreement scheme for e-governance system without verification table. *Indian Academy of Sciences*.
- Dawes, S. S. (2008). The Evolution and Continuing Challenges of E-Governance. *American Society for Public Administration*.
- Dhal, S. (2020). Situating Digital India Mission in Pursuit of Good Governance: A Study of Electronic Governance Initiatives in the Indian Province of Odisha*. *Indian Journal of Public Administration*, 66(1) 110–126.
- Frank Bannister, R. C. (2012). Defining E-Governance.
- Frida Guñiza, N. S. (2017). When citizens choose not to participate in volunteering geographic information to e-governance: a case study from Mexico. *Geo Journal*.
- From One-stop shop to No-stop shop: An E-Government Stage Model. (2019). *Government Information Quarterly*.
- Garg, P. (2008). e-Governance- A Way to Good Governance. *The Indian Journal of Political Science*.
- Geetha A. Rubasundram, R. R. (2019). Corruption and Good Governance. *Journal of Southeast Asian Economies*.
- Hamzah Ritchi, I. W. (2015). Research Program on Key Success Factors of e-Government and their Impact on Accounting Information Quality.
- Heeks, R. (2005). e-Government as a Carrier of Context. *Journal of Public Policy*, Vol. 25, No. 1, pp. 51-74.
- Hellerman, M. K. (1975). One-Stop Shopping for Social Services. *Social Work*.
- Mukherjee, V. (2013). Determinants of Stamp Duty Revenue in Indian States. *South Asian Journal of Macroeconomics and Public Finance*.
- Napitupulu, D. (2014). The Critical Success Factors Study for e-Government Implementation.
- Nirmaljeet Singh Kalsi, R. K. (2015). A strategic framework for good governance through e-governance optimization: A Case Study In Punjab.

- Onyango, G. (2017). One-Step-Shop in Service Delivery in Kenya. *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance*.
- Palekar, S. (2010). E-Governance Initiatives in India: An Analytical Study of the Karnataka State. *Indian Political Science Association*.
- Paul Brous, M. J. (2015). Advancing e-Government Using the Internet of Things: A Systematic Review of Benefits. *International Federation for Information Processing*.
- Rana, V. S. (2013). E-Licensing in DGFT: A Best E-Governance Application V.
- Rose, R. (2005). A Global Diffusion Model of e-Governance. *Journal of Public Policy*.
- Sameer Goel, R. D. (2012). Critical Factors for Successful Implementation of E-governance Programs: A Case Study of HUDA. *Global Journal of Flexible Systems Management*.
- Sheshadri Chatterjee, A. K. (2018). Alignment of IT Authority and Citizens of Proposed Smart Cities in India: System Security and Privacy Perspective. *Global Journal of Flexible Systems Management*.
- Sumanjeet. (2006). E-Governance: An Overview in the Indian Context. *The Indian Journal of Political Science*.
- Taufiq Agung Cahyono, T. D. (2019). Acceptance Factors and User Design of Mobile e-Government Website.
- Toni G.L.A. van der Meer, D. G. (2014). e-Democracy: Exploring the Current Stage of e-Government. *Journal of Information Policy*.
- Vinod Kumar, B. M. (2007). Factors for Successful e-Government Adoption: a Conceptual Framework . *Electronic Journal of e-Government*.
- Warf, B. (2014). Geographies of E-Government in Latin America and the Caribbean . *Journal of Latin American Geography*, Vol. 13, No. 1, pp. 169-185.
- Westholm, H. (2005). Models of Improving e-Governance by Back Office Re-Organisation and Integration Author(s):. *Journal of Public Policy*.
- Whasun Jho, K.-j. S. (2007). Governance in the Information Age: A Comparative Analysis of e-Governance in Major Asian Countries.
- Yadav, S. (2009). Implementing E-Governance in India Exploring the Administrative Reforms Agenda. *Indian Political Science Association*.
- Yan Li, H. S. (2019). Service quality, perceived value, and citizens' continuous-use intention regarding e-government: Empirical evidence from China. *Information and Management*.
- Barthwal, C. (2003). E-GOVERNANCE FOR GOOD GOVERNANCE . *The Indian Journal of Political Science* , Vol. 64, No. 3/4 , pp. 285-308 .
- Baxter, D. J. (2017). E-GOVERNANCE AND E-PARTICIPATION VIA ONLINE CITIZEN BUDGETS AND ELECTRONIC LOBBYING. *World Affairs*, Volume 180, no.4, pp 4-24.
- BUSSELL, J. (2012). E-Governance and Corruption in the States: Can Technology Serve the "Aam Aadmi". *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 47, No. 25 , pp. 77-85 .
- Chatterji, T. (2018). Digital urbanism in a transitional economy – a review of India's municipal e-governance policy. *Journal of Asian Public Policy*, 11:3, 334-349.
- Dhal, S. (2020). Situating Digital India Mission in Pursuit of Good Governance: A Study of Electronic Governance Initiatives in the Indian Province of Odisha*. *Indian Journal of Public Administration*, 66(1) 110–126.
- Heeks, R. (2005). e-Government as a Carrier of Context . *Journal of Public Policy*, Vol. 25, No. 1 , pp. 51-74 .

- Huffman, B. D. (2017). E-Participation in the Philippines: A Capabilities Approach to Socially Inclusive Governance. *ejournal of edemocracy*, 9(2): 24-46.
- Kluver, R. (2005). The Architecture of Control: a Chinese Strategy for e-Governance. *Journal of Public Policy*, Vol. 25, No. 1, pp. 75-97 .
- Malik, M. T. (2015). E-government, Economic Growth and Trade: A Simultaneous Equation Approach. *The pakistran development review*, volume 55, n0. 4.
- MELITSKI, D. J. (2007). E-GOVERNMENT AND E-GOVERNANCE: CONVERGING CONSTRUCTS OF PUBLIC SECTOR INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATIONS TECHNOLOGIES . *Public Administration Quarterly*, Vol. 31, No. 1/2, pp. 87-120.
- Mohammad, H. (2009). E-government in Jordan . *European Journal of Scientific Research*, Vol.35 No.2 , pp.188-197 .
- Prasad, K. (2012). E-Governance Policy for Modernizing Government through Digital Democracy in India . *Journal of Information Policy*, Vol. 2 , pp. 183-203 .
- Roy, J. (2003). The Relational Dynamics of E-Governance: A Case Study of the City of Ottawa . *Public Performance & Management Review*, Vol. 26, No. 4, pp. 391-403 .
- Sang M lee, X. t. (2005). Current practices of leading e-government countries. *Communications of the ACM*, Volume 48, No.10.
- Shafi, S. M. (2012). Best Practices in E government: A review of Some Innovative Models Proposed in Different Countries. *International Journal of Electrical & Computer Sciences*, Volume 12, no.1.
- Shkarlet, S. O. (2018). Comparative analysis of best practices . *ADMINISTRAȚIE ȘI MANAGEMENT PUBLIC*, 34, Page no. 118-136.
- Sonia Royo, V. P. (2020). Decide Madrid: A Critical Analysis of an Award-Winning e-Participation Initiative. *Sustainability*, volume 12(4).
- UNReport. (2020). *Digital government in the decade of Action for sustainable development*. United Nations, New York: Department of Economic and Social Affairs.
- Waisanen. (2002). The future of e-Government: Technology-fueled management Tools. *Public Management*, 84(5), 6-9.
- Warf, B. (2014). Geographies of E-Government in Latin America and the Caribbean . *Journal of Latin American Geography*, Vol. 13, No. 1, pp. 169-185.
- Weiling ke, K. K. (2004). Successful e-government in Singapore. *Communications of the ACM*, volume 47, no. 6.
- Westholm, H. (2005). Models of Improving e-Governance by Back Office Re-Organisation and Integration . *Journal of Public Policy*, Vol. 25, No. 1, pp. 99-132 .
- Yadav, N. (2010). AGRICULTURAL MARKETING AND E-GOVERNANCE : STRATEGIES TO MEET THE CHALLENGES IN THE 21st CENTURY . *The Indian Journal of Political Science*, Vol. 71, No.1 , pp. 345.
- Souza, C. (2019). The world produces 2 billion tons of trash. Can technology help?. Retrieved 19 April 2021, from <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2019/09/the-benefits-of-digitizing-waste-management/>
- Hangzhou growing 'smarter' thanks to AI technology. (2017). Retrieved 19 April 2021, from https://www.alwihdainfo.com/Hangzhou-growing-smarter-thanks-to-AI-technology_a58657.html
- Michelle Toh and Leonie Erasmus, M. (2019). Alibaba's 'City Brain' is slashing congestion in its hometown. Retrieved 19 April 2021, from <https://edition.cnn.com/2019/01/15/tech/alibaba-city-brain-hangzhou/index.html>

Buenos Aires | Interact. Retrieved 19 April 2021, from <https://www.interact-lighting.com/global/customer-stories/buenos-aires>

The United Nations E-Government Survey, 2020. (2020).